

### 6.3.13 ANNEX AND REFERENCES

Description	Reference link	Attached document
IDABC existing method and Draft updated method	<a href="http://ec.europa.eu/isa/actions/documents/isa_3.1_description_of_the_method.pdf">http://ec.europa.eu/isa/actions/documents/isa_3.1_description_of_the_method.pdf</a> <a href="http://ec.europa.eu/isa/documents/actions/ks-sc9-d04-03-ict-assessment-method_v5.00.pdf">http://ec.europa.eu/isa/documents/actions/ks-sc9-d04-03-ict-assessment-method_v5.00.pdf</a>	

## 6.4 EUROPEAN LEGISLATION IDENTIFIER (2016.08)

### 6.4.1 IDENTIFICATION OF THE ACTION

Type of Activity	Common frameworks
Service in charge	Publications Office
Associated Services	Luxembourg, France, United Kingdom, Ireland, Denmark, Council of the EU, e-Law working group (e-law), Parliament, Council

### 6.4.2 EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

ELI is a basic building block for the interoperability and exchange of legislation data in Europe. It provides a practical and flexible system for naming legislation documents and for sharing metadata that is sufficiently standardised to realise the benefits of interoperable legislative data, while respecting each Member State's unique legislative and legal traditions.

ELI comes as a response to the problem of not being able to refer in a unique and commonly acceptable way to the EU and national legislation thus hindering the exchange and sharing thereof, although it is at large available in electronic format.

ELI proposes a unique identifier (HTTP URI), which should be recognisable, readable and understandable by both humans and computers. In addition, ELI proposes a set of metadata elements to describe legislation in compliance with a recommended ontology. ELI aims to take into account not only the complexity and specificity of regional, national and European legislative systems, but also changes in legal resources (e.g. consolidations, repealed acts, codes etc.). ELI has been carefully constructed to respect the legal and constitutional differences between Member States.

With the ISA funding received in the frame of ISA work program 2014-2015, a number of assets were developed in view of facilitating the implementation of ELI by Member States. Since the beginning of this initiative, ELI has been deployed by different stakeholders including a growing number of Member States, which are considering ELI as a solution to enrich their legal acts and improve interoperability

---

between systems. As the ELI initiative is starting to bear fruits, the present request aims to pursue the effort started in the context of ISA Action 1.21 (2014-2015).

### 6.4.3 OBJECTIVES

The objective of ELI is to enable a greater degree of semantic interoperability of legislation data in general and in particular between European and Member States systems. By promoting the access and exchange of legal information within and across borders, the ELI initiative supports cooperation between European public administrations, citizens and businesses. By putting forward recommendations specifying how administrations, businesses and citizens can improve interoperability within the EU and across borders, the ELI initiative is compliant with the ISA<sup>2</sup> objectives and in line with the European Interoperability Framework (EIF).

Further, the initiative is also compliant with the European Union commitment to open up legislation as part of the implementation of the G8 Open Data Charter which aims to promote, among others, transparency and governments' accountability and contributes to the development of the common area of freedom, security and justice.

Finally, by making legislation available on the web in a structured way, it will be easier to find, share and reuse legislation, as prescribed by the Public Sector Information (PSI) Directive.

To pursue the work initiated in the context of the ISA working program 2014-2015, and thus contribute to the wider adoption of ELI by Member States and beyond, funding is sought to conduct activities in line with the below list of operational objectives :

1. Provide assistance to Member States, candidate countries and EFTA states in implementing ELI;
2. Maintain ELI know-ledge base and facilitate information sharing;
3. Guarantee maintenance and evolution of existing ELI assets and solutions;
4. Develop additional added-value services and tools facilitating the deployment of ELI by stakeholders;
5. Standardisation activities/ cooperation with existing standards groups and communities in the EU and internationally;
6. Dissemination of results.

### 6.4.4 SCOPE

The below series of tasks would be conducted in the scope of the proposed ELI support action:

---

1) Provide assistance to Member States in implementing ELI

This task foresees delivering technical and organisational assistance to Member States who are interested in implementing ELI; assistance can be delivered in the form of workshops, trainings, technical meetings, consultancy, etc.

2) Maintain ELI know-ledge base and facilitate information sharing

As the number of Member States adopting ELI is growing, it is important to take on board the knowledge and expertise acquired by the new ELI implementers and update technical and general documentation (implementation guide, good practices, technical guidelines, etc.). Facilitating information exchange and peer review exercises via appropriate fora is an asset to share a common goal.

3) Guarantee maintenance and evolution of existing ELI assets and solutions

A number of generic assets have been developed since the beginning of the ELI initiative. Not only must these be maintained, but they must also evolve. This encompasses the adaptation to existing ELI assets to changes in formats, standards or platforms and further evolutions of the ELI CELLAR. This also includes possible adaptation/ configuration of developed solutions with the objective of making them more easily re-usable by Member States or other stakeholders;

4) Analyse and develop additional added-value services and tools:

Analyse, study and build services and tools to foster interoperability and create added-value between stakeholders and systems. Survey stakeholders in order to identify which services/ tools would best respond to actual user needs; Prospection and analysis of solutions in view of conceiving and deploying tools and services for Member States (ie. mutualisation of systems and resources, RDF transformations, visualisation tools, increased linking granularity...) Development, deployment, testing, hosting and related tasks to ensure the functioning of the services/ tools. Investigation on legal requirements as to licensing/ reuse.

The following components have already been identified:

- Visualisations tools
- Editing tool for semantic metadata
- RDF transformations
- Tools for preparation and conversion of legacy data at the Member State Level
- Tools for searching across semantic metadata and full-text of legal publications

5) Standardisation as well as synergies with existing initiatives in the EU and internationally.

This includes continuing to progress ELI as a standard in the EU and internationally as well as engaging with groups and communities working in areas that relate to ELI;

6) Dissemination of results

- Outreach to commercial and non-commercial re-users as well as to the academic community;
- Organisation of events to promote ELI;
- Drafting success stories; best practices, news or other editorial contents about ELI for various dissemination channels in various languages;
- Translation and editing activities;
- Reporting about progress on ELI and presenting ELI project to various types of audiences.

#### **6.4.5 PROBLEM STATEMENT**

The exchange of legal information is limited by the differences that exist in the various national legal systems, as well as the differences in their technical systems used to store and display legislation through their respective websites. This hampers the interoperability between the information systems of national and European institutions, despite the increased availability of documents in electronic format.

Prior to ELI there was no agreed approach for identifying legislation documents and exchanging information on them that was sufficiently uniform to achieve interoperability and sufficiently flexible to be consistent with each Member States constitutional and legal requirements and history.

ELI provides a flexible, consistent and reliable way to uniquely identify legislation documents from different jurisdictions, and to reference and share those documents. ELI achieves this by providing a unique and stable identifier for each legislative act in the European Union, while at the same time taking full account of the specific requirements of national legal systems.

The European Council in its Council Conclusions invites ELI as a voluntary scheme for Member States. Its flexible means and the support provided to adopt and implement ELI will benefit significantly Member States.

ELI is a foundational piece of architecture for this era of online legislation, therefore the benefits of ELI are very wide.

#### **6.4.6 EXPECTED BENEFICIARIES AND ANTICIPATED BENEFITS**

A Member State having implemented ELI, will be able to exchange legislative information more quickly, efficiently and reliably. ELI also facilitates efficient searching of legislation of other jurisdictions with cross border searches. It also enables a more precise investigation and understanding of the

transposition of directives. A concrete example thereof is France who successfully implemented in July 2015 a mechanism to link ELI references from <http://data.europa.eu/> ELI and display them on Légifrance: <http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/>. The implementation of this interoperability feature by France demonstrates a concrete benefit of the ELI system.

ELI is cost effective because it is merely a specialisation of how resources are generally identified on the web. As ELI is targeted as being an extension to existing systems, the initiative can be implemented by Member States at a reasonable cost.

Finally, it is important to note that the approach to ELI benefits from the work that goes into technologies and standards for Linked Open Data and the semantic web.

Beneficiaries	Anticipated benefits
Member States	Facilitating access to legislation reduces burden for public administration. Structuring data and optimisation of production flows can lead to reduction of production cost for legal information publishers. Improved transparency
Member States - implementers	Member States can draw on the knowledge base which has been acquired based on the experience of the pioneering implementers to implement ELI. Technical documentation as well as training and assistance can be offered to facilitate the implementation of ELI by future implementers.
European Commission	Improved transparency and better integration and efficient exchange of information, e.g. transposition of Directives. Increased quality and reliability of data. Greater interoperability and improved cooperation.
Citizens and businesses	Effective, user-friendly and faster access to legislation as well as exchange of information between heterogeneous systems for citizens and legal professionals (legislators, judges ...). Improved discoverability of legal data, reducing costs for businesses. Smart use of data allowing the development of new value-added services on existing data. An improvement of metadata, through the ELI ontology, could lead to more informative summaries of legislation, especially for non-legal professionals.
Candidate countries, EFTA and other countries	Better integration and efficient exchange of legal information with the European Union.

## 6.4.7 RELATED EU ACTIONS / POLICIES

Action / Policy	Description of relation
Directive 2013/37/EC	Re-use of public sector information
Interconnection and exchange of information	ELI guarantees a cost-effective public access to reliable and up-to-date legislation and allowing for a greater, faster and efficient exchange of information between national legal information systems and EUR-Lex
National implementing measures 'NIM'	Increase efficiency and information of national implementation measures "NIM"
ISA Action 1.1-Promoting semantic interoperability amongst the European Union Member States (SEMIC)	ISA Action 1.1 will provide support in the course of the ISA Action 1.21, in particular regarding the specification of the semantic attributes
ISA Action 1.13-LEOS	Open Source software for editing legislation would be of interest as an input tool for legislation to be used in combination with an ELI compliant storage and dissemination environment
ISA Action 1.20 Application of EU Law: provision of cross-sector communication and problem solving tools	Action supporting the application of EU law, allows you to transmit data directly from your back-office systems to the EC, including the notification of the transposition of directives.
ISA <sup>2</sup> Action 'Participatory knowledge for supporting decision making'	Underlying semantic structures and data standards used by reusable tools that allow the electronic participation of stakeholders, the analysis of the captured opinions and the discovery and generation of knowledge will provide feedback for proposing an interoperable approach for identifying legislation documents and the supporting assets and solutions.
ISA <sup>2</sup> Action 'Legislation interoperability tools (LEGIT)'	Existing or under development building blocks (i.e. software, tools etc.) that support and improve the electronic exchange of documents and metadata in the context of the legislative process and the transformation between different formats will be taken into account for proposing an interoperable approach for identifying legislation documents and the supporting assets and solutions.
'ISA <sup>2</sup> Action ICT implications of EU legislation'	Results and conclusions related with the properly preparation and evaluation of EU legislation regarding the ICT implications will be taken into account for proposing an interoperable approach for identifying legislation documents and the supporting assets and solutions.
ISA <sup>2</sup> Action 'Interinstitutional framework for digital OLP management'	The proposed interoperable ways of structuring the content of the documents that need to be exchanged between the institutions for the purposes of the ordinary legislative

	procedure will be taken into account for proposing an interoperable approach for identifying legislation documents and the supporting assets and solutions.
ISA <sup>2</sup> Action 'Application of EU law: provision of cross-sector communication and problem solving tools (THEMIS)'	Reusable tools and the underlying semantic structures and data standards for monitoring the application of EU law will be taken into account for proposing an interoperable approach for identifying legislation documents and the supporting assets and solutions.

#### 6.4.8 REUSE OF SOLUTIONS DEVELOPED BY ISA, ISA<sup>2</sup> OR OTHER EU / NATIONAL INITIATIVES

The essence of ELI is to be reusable to facilitate interoperability between systems. Below are a few examples of ELI solutions directly reusable by stakeholders:

##### 1. The ELI ontology

The Eli ontology published on <http://publications.europa.eu/mdr/eli/>. The publication of the ELI ontology on the interoperability platform Joinup is foreseen.

##### 2. The ELI system

The mechanism to link ELI references from <http://data.europa.eu/ELI> and display on Légifrance <http://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/> is an example of reuse of the ELI system.

Users will find that national implementing measures on Légifrance include EU ELI references retrieved through <http://data.europa.eu/ELI>. This implementation is proof that the project has been true to its objective of interoperability for Member States.

##### 3. ELI implementation guidelines

A set of guidelines and good practice documentation (general and technical) have been developed to help interested stakeholders implement ELI. These guidelines include information on http URI templates, metadata to apply to legislative acts and much more.

##### 4. ELI website

An ELI knowledge base hosted on EUR-Lex developed by the ELI Taskforce. This knowledge base is a crucial asset for the Member States and interested stakeholders who want to implement ELI for improved interoperability.

##### 5. Open source ELI Cellar and envisaged ELI Open-Source tools

Development of an Open Source publishing system configured with the ELI ontology to be made available to interested Member States and stakeholders. Further open-source tools to facilitate the implementation and use of ELI as well as the generation of added-value interoperability solutions are envisaged.

Outputs generated in the context of this project aim at being reused in the context of publishing legislation, however, ELI could be used at national level in other domains as well (identification of bills as they pass through various stages).

As ELI supports open linked data initiatives, it could play a role in national debates on open data too.

#### 6.4.9 EXPECTED RE-USABLE OUTPUTS (solutions and instruments)

Output name	ELI ontology
Description	The ELI ontology is available for use and implementation and provides a solution to uniquely identify, structure and enrich legal acts. For more information, please refer to the ELI ontology repository on: <a href="http://publications.europa.eu/mdr/eli/">http://publications.europa.eu/mdr/eli/</a>
Reference	<a href="http://publications.europa.eu/mdr/eli/">http://publications.europa.eu/mdr/eli/</a>
Target release date / Status	Published since December 2014

Output name	ELI implementation guide
Description	This is an implementation guide, covering both general and technical aspects, aimed at helping Members States implement ELI.
Reference	(development ongoing)
Target release date / Status	Q4 2015

Output name	Open Source ELI Cellar
Description	Open Source publishing system configured with the ELI ontology. System to be made available to Member States who are interested in an advanced system pre-configured with ELI ontology
Reference	(development on-going)
Target release date / Status	2016

Output name	List of open source tools (list not exhaustive)
-------------	---



Description	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Visualisations tool</li> <li>- Editing tools</li> <li>- RDF transformations</li> <li>- Tools for preparation and conversion of legacy data</li> <li>- Tools for searching semantic data and full-text</li> </ul>
Reference	Depending on ISA <sup>2</sup> financing
Target release date / Status	2016

## 6.4.10 ORGANISATIONAL APPROACH

### 6.4.10.1 Expected stakeholders and their representatives

Stakeholders	Representatives
Project Manager	Publications Office of the European Union
Chair	Valeria Sciarrino Head of Unit Official Journals and Case-law production Publications Office of the European Union <a href="mailto:valeria.sciarrino@publications.europa.eu">valeria.sciarrino@publications.europa.eu</a> <a href="http://www.publications.europa.eu">www.publications.europa.eu</a>
Co-chairs	<u>Luxembourg</u> John Dann Chargé de la direction adjoint Ministère d'État Service central de législation <a href="mailto:john.dann@scl.etat.lu">john.dann@scl.etat.lu</a> <a href="http://www.legilux.public.lu">www.legilux.public.lu</a>  <u>France</u> Jean-Michel Thivel Chef du service Administration générale, documentation et informatique Premier ministre Secrétariat général des affaires européennes <a href="mailto:jean-michel.thivel@sgae.gouv.fr">jean-michel.thivel@sgae.gouv.fr</a>  <u>United Kingdom</u> John Sheridan Head of Legislation Services The National Archives <a href="mailto:john.sheridan@nationalarchives.gsi.gov.uk">john.sheridan@nationalarchives.gsi.gov.uk</a>

	<p><u>Denmark</u> Nina Koch Director Ministry of Justice <a href="mailto:civilstyrelsen@civilstyrelsen.dk">civilstyrelsen@civilstyrelsen.dk</a> <a href="http://www.civilstyrelsen.dk">www.civilstyrelsen.dk</a></p> <p><u>Ireland</u> Gerry Matthews eISB Project team - electronic Irish Statute Book (eISB) Office of the Attorney General <a href="mailto:gerry_matthews@ag.irlgov.ie">gerry_matthews@ag.irlgov.ie</a> <a href="http://www.irishstatutebook.ie">www.irishstatutebook.ie</a></p>
--	---

#### 6.4.10.2 Communication plan

e-Law group of the EU Council	EU e-law members	Twice a year during each Presidency, June and December.
Promote and share the work on ELI	National/ International community	Specific events to be organised
Steering Committee	Publications Office, Luxembourg, France, Denmark, Ireland, United Kingdom	Quarterly
Stakeholders interested in ELI	ELI website published on EUR-Lex	Regular updates

#### 6.4.10.3 Governance approach

A Task Force was set-up under the auspices of the EU Council Working Party e-Law (e-Law) to study the future developments of the ELI standard. The Task Force is made up of Denmark, France, Luxembourg (chair), Ireland, the United-Kingdom and the Publications Office of the EU.

The approach is characterized by helping other Member States adopt ELI, by sharing knowledge/expertise, without imposing a strict given schema and by taking into account their national specificities.

The project is followed by a Steering Committee, chaired by the Publications Office of the EU and co-chaired by France, Luxembourg, United-Kingdom, Ireland and Denmark.

The Taskforce and Steering Committee meet at regular intervals in order to review the ongoing activities and collectively decide on the developments to be conducted in line with the adopted strategy.

## 6.4.11 TECHNICAL APPROACH

ELI is based on a gradual three-step approach defined as follows:

- uniform rules governing the identification and designation of and access to national and European legislation (URI: Uniform Resource Identifiers),
- metadata describing the legislative resources,
- ontology - information exchange format - describing the properties of the legislative texts and their relationship with other concepts or legislation.

ELI is being implemented on a voluntary, gradual and optional basis alongside existing identifiers.

Further technical documentation about the ELI technical approach is accessible via the following link: <http://publications.europa.eu/mdr/eli/> and in future via the ELI website hosted on EUR-Lex.

## 6.4.12 COSTS AND MILESTONES

### 6.4.12.1 Breakdown of anticipated costs and related milestones

Phase: Inception Execution Operational	Description of milestones reached or to be reached	Anticipated Allocations (KEUR)	Budget line ISA <sup>2</sup> / others (specify)	Start date (QX/YYYY)	End date (QX/YYYY)
Assist Member States in ELI adoption:	Assistance workshops; Trainings; Technical meetings; Consultancy (cost/benefit analysis; impact assessment, technical solutions); Assistance with mass transformation of existing data	250	ISA <sup>2</sup>		
Maintain knowledge base and facilitate information sharing	Update of technical and general documentation (review and translation) ; Management of peer reviews and information exchange with stakeholders	90	ISA <sup>2</sup>		

Guarantee maintenance and evolution of existing ELI assets and solutions	Update of technical tools to changes in formats, standards, platforms;  Open-sourcing of solutions, including their hosting;  Adaptations in context of re-use by MSs or other stakeholders	100	ISA <sup>2</sup>		
Develop added-value services	Analyse, study and build added-value services and tools  Prospection and analysis activities	260	ISA <sup>2</sup>		
Standards	Progressing ELI as a standard  Participation in groups and communities working in areas that relate to ELI	60	ISA <sup>2</sup>		
Dissemination of results	Reporting in English and in French, Drafting news, best practices, updates on ELI, news items, Translation  Presenting ELI to appropriate audiences  Half year report to the Council's eLaw group  Organisation of events to promote ELI	150	ISA <sup>2</sup>		
	Total	910			

#### 6.4.12.2 Breakdown of ISA<sup>2</sup> funding per budget year

Budget Year	Phase	Anticipated allocations (in KEUR)	Executed budget (in KEUR)
2016		400	

2017		510	
2018			
2019			

#### 6.4.13 ANNEX AND REFERENCES

description	Reference link	Attached document
Conclusions of the Council of the European Union on the European Legislation Identifier (ELI) 2012/C 325/02	<a href="http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=OJ:C:2012:325:0003:0011:EN:PDF">http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=OJ:C:2012:325:0003:0011:EN:PDF</a>	
Report on the introduction of the ELI	9922/13 Jurinfo 25 28 May 2013	
Website informing on the progress of ELI in France	<a href="http://www.eli.fr">http://www.eli.fr</a>	
Letters of support from Taskforce members		4