EUROPEAN
STATISTICAL
SYSTEM

PEER REVIEW REPORT

ON COMPLIANCE WITH THE EUROPEAN STATISTICS CODE OF PRACTICE AND FURTHER IMPROVEMENT AND DEVELOPMENT OF THE NATIONAL STATISTICAL SYSTEM

SPAIN

Jonas Markelevičius
Thomas Burg
Jukka Jalava
Richard Laux

July 2022

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

While Spain is highly decentralised in terms of administration and government, the production of official national and European statistics is the task of the central institutions of Government and is not devolved to the autonomous communities.

The Law of 12/1989 on the Public Statistical Function establishes the National Statistical Institute (INE in Spanish) as the central body of official statistics in Spain and assigns to it the status of an autonomous agency. Other official producers are statistical units belonging to certain ministries and the Bank of Spain. In total there are seventeen Other National Authorities developing, producing and disseminating official statistics.

The Law on the Public Statistical Function is at the heart of an effective suite of laws and regulations that govern the operation of the statistical system. It lays down the principles governing statistical activities such as data collection, data processing and dissemination. It defines the conditions under which it is mandatory to supply data, regulates statistical confidentiality and statistical planning and gives INE the responsibility of coordinating the units making up the Spanish statistical system. Most of the Ministries have their own statistical unit and the coordination function for all the units is strongly supported by the Interministerial Statistics Commission - one of three national bodies that are responsible for different aspects of statistical governance, along with the High Council of Statistics and the Interregional Statistics Committee.

INE is a mature organisation, well respected by a wide range of stakeholders and adequately resourced - in 2021 it had just over 3,000 employees. Training of staff – both those of INE and of Other National Authorities – is a real strength of the system. The teaching of statistics at universities is organised with the involvement of INE staff. The study programmes are well adapted to meet the needs of official statisticians. INE also engages effectively with the university sector to support development projects, for example by facilitating access to microdata.

Another strength relates to administrative data. The Law on the Public Statistical Function enables INE to request access to data to support activities covered by the 4-year National Statistical Plan. There are formal agreements with the most important administrative data holders and this enabled INE to use administrative data in the most recent population, housing and agricultural censuses, which reduced statistical burdens and increased cost-effectiveness. The use of administrative data is, however, not limited to censuses: there are a total of 74 statistical products that use administrative data as a unique or complementary source.

Indeed, INE is committed to cost-effectiveness: its "Cost of Projects" system is a powerful system enabling the evaluation of the human resources allocated to each project based on staff input, supporting the planning and monitoring of the use of resources. In addition, INE has demonstrated the willingness and ability to reduce costs - not only by seeking to use administrative data where possible, but also by proactively decreasing sample sizes while continuing to meet user needs for various surveys, including flagship data collections such as those used to produce structural business statistics, labour force surveys and economic situation surveys.

INE's commitment to quality monitoring and reporting is clearly visible and its Quality Committee plays an important role. This Committee involves all the units of INE and ensures co-participation in decisions on quality matters; quality is assured annually and reflected through the global report on the status and evaluation of the operations of each of INE's statistical production units.

INE has been innovative in its approach to statistical production. It has established new partnerships to access privately held data (supermarket scanner data to supplement existing estimates of food

prices and the use of mobile phone data as a source of information about mobility and tourism patterns). It has started to use new methods such as machine learning to be applied in different production processes and for developing experimental statistics.

Moreover, it has started to implement an innovative project called the "Data Lake", which includes a statistical data repository and supporting metadata, together with integrated analytical tools.

Overall, there is a high level of compliance with the European Statistics Code of Practice (ES CoP) throughout the Spanish statistical system. However, the peer review team identified four compliance-relevant and seventeen improvement-related recommendations grouped under six main headings, listed below with their related recommendations.

RECOMMENDATIONS

I.   Improving the legal and institutional environment

Under the existing Spanish Law on the Legal Regime of the Public Sector[1], the President of INE can only be recruited from the cadre of civil servants. By definition, this excludes certain potential candidates. In addition, the Law on the Public Statistical Function does not specify the requirement that candidates for the post of President should have an appropriate professional background, or the potential reasons for dismissal.

The peer review team noted that recommendation 1 from the 2015 peer review of the Spanish statistical system has not yet been implemented. The recommendation was that: "The National Statistical Institute should carry out actions to promote the necessary legislative amendments, laying down clear provisions for the appointment and dismissal of the President of the National Statistical Institute, in line with the European statistics Code of Practice (European statistics Code of Practice, indicator 1.8)."

Echoing this recommendation from the 2015 peer review report, and consistent with a press release[2] by the European Statistics Governance Advisory Body (ESGAB) expressing concern about developments in the Spanish National Statistical Institute, the peer review team sees merit in reviewing aspects of the Law on the Public Statistical Function. This should include setting out (and hence giving prominence to) the reasons for dismissal of the President, which are set out in Articles 63 and 64 of the Law of the Basic Statute of Public Employees (resignation, loss of Spanish nationality, disciplinary sanctions and disqualification from holding any public sector job). The peer review team considered this to be particularly important given that, in recent times, changes in government were followed by an appointment of a new President of INE.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

1. The Ministry of Economic Affairs and Digital Transformation should review the legal basis for the appointment of the President of INE to enable non-civil servants to be considered for appointment; in addition, the Law on the Public Statistical Function should highlight the reasons for dismissal of

---

[1]In Spanish, *Ley 40/2015, de 1 de octubre, de Régimen Jurídico del Sector Público* (https://www.boe.es/buscar/act.php?id=BOE-A-2015-10566). Art. 63.3.

[2]https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/documents/34693/14833496/INE+Press+Release_final_for+the+website.pdf/e88f56ad-bc4d-045a-a96a-4b822bcf818b?t=1657028630363

the President of INE in the sense of Regulation 223/2009. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicator 1.8)

INE has agreements with some, but not all, holders of administrative data. A systematic approach would help to guarantee the ongoing supply of data, provide an opportunity to ensure all relevant details are captured and, when published, provide clarity about the way in which administrative data are used for statistical purposes.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

2. INE should coordinate the development of a comprehensive set of agreements with administrative data holders. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicator 8.6)

The High Council of Statistics comprises representatives of producers, users and respondents. However, the Interministerial Statistics Commission also provides producers with a voice, meaning that the input of users is proportionally diluted. User input would be strengthened by the establishment of external user groups to capture the needs of, for example, business, academia and researchers, civil society and trade unions.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

3. INE should review the role, membership and operation of the High Council of Statistics to ensure that the needs of users – on topics relevant to them – can be more fully taken into account. This review should evaluate the role that external (and sectoral) user groups might play and how they might support the High Council of Statistics. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicator 11.1)

II.   Improving organisation and structures

INE comprises the headquarters in Madrid and offices in each province. The provincial offices are primarily responsible for statistical data collection but also have administrative responsibilities. This structure appears somewhat old-fashioned in an increasingly digital data collection era.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

4. The Ministry of Economic Affairs and Digital Transformation should commission a review of the structure of INE, focusing in particular on the role of – and need for – the statistical activities of the provincial offices. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicators 10.2 and 10.4)

Some Ministries producing official statistics have centralised units – Ministerial Statistics Units – that support, among other things, the implementation of common standards across all those individuals and teams that produce official statistics. Other Ministries producing official statistics do not have such centralised units. While the organisation of statistical activity is the responsibility of the Ministry, it is important that arrangements are in place to ensure that the benefits associated with Ministerial Statistics Units are enjoyed.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

5. INE should coordinate a review of the statistical arrangements in those Ministries producing official statistics, which do not have a centralised statistical unit, to identify ways to strengthen user engagement, develop common standards, exploit administrative sources most effectively and use harmonised statistical tools. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicators 1bis.1 and 10.3)

INE provides valuable advice on technical statistical issues to the Other National Authorities developing, producing and disseminating official statistics. However, the nature of the advice provided, and the circumstances in which the advice should be sought, have not yet been formally established. The establishment of more detailed protocols related to data transfer, statistical confidentiality thresholds, metadata and the use of standard classifications would improve the comparability of the statistics produced by the various Other National Authorities and would enhance coordination.

Doing so, and publishing the advice, would provide clarity about expectations towards INE and each Other National Authority.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

6. INE should work with the Other National Authorities developing, producing and disseminating official statistics to develop formal agreements covering mutual responsibilities in relation to data transfer, methodology and quality, statistical confidentiality thresholds, common standards, dissemination policy and user engagement. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicators 1bis.2, 3.1 and 7.2)

III.   Optimising the use of resources

INE has highly qualified staff and participation in training programmes is facilitated. However, there is no systematic human resources evaluation process to determine the assignment, performance and training needs of INE personnel. INE explained that staff performance evaluation systems have not as yet been developed in the Spanish Administration and that INE has not unilaterally developed them.

A system of staff appraisal based on communication with the staff would further allow talent management and ensure that both the career expectations of staff and the needs of INE are met. Therefore, the peer review team sees a need to improve communication with employees about their performance.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

7. INE should consider establishing a standardised process of staff appraisals and a system for evaluating the performance of employees. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicator 7.6)

INE is ambitious about standardising processes and developing modern tools for its statistical work. Notably, the coordinated action of the methodology unit and the ICT unit makes it possible to share resources and investments and contributes to the identification of the potential for innovation and modernisation to optimise statistical processes. However, there is frequently a need to outsource important tasks (particularly IT) because INE is not competitive enough in the labour market to hire staff with adequate competencies.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

8. INE should increase its competitiveness in the labour market and consider improving the package offered to new recruits with the objective of reducing the need for outsourcing. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicators 3.1, 7.5 and 10.2)

INE and the Other National Authorities plan to implement many innovative projects. INE's plans enjoy broad support from the High Council of Statistics and other bodies. Resourcing is currently sufficient, but resources dedicated to innovative projects which are not part of regular statistical production can sometimes be vulnerable in times of financial hardship. Therefore, it seems important to uphold the level of resources for the medium and long term.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

9. The Ministry of Economic Affairs and Digital Transformation should ensure that adequate resourcing is made available in the annual work programme to guarantee that the objectives of important innovation projects are achieved. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicators 3.1 and 3.2)

IV.   Improvement of dissemination

The 17 Autonomous Communities have each passed separate statistical Laws on Public Statistical Functions regulating their statistical activities. However, this regional statistical activity does not form part of the Spanish (Central) statistical system. Currently, 16 of the Central Statistical Bodies of the Autonomous Communities (OCECA) receive information from INE under embargo, both relating to their territory and to the national total, for the purpose of preparing and publishing news releases relating to their respective territorial scopes in a synchronised manner with INE. This degree of pre-release access to bodies outside the Spanish (Central) statistical system cannot be seen as being of limited scope.

To comply with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

10. INE should reconsider the practice of giving the Central Statistical Bodies of the Autonomous Communities pre-release information under embargo. (Compliance-relevant: ES CoP, Indicator 6.7)

INE has a clear policy for pre-release access, which is made public on its website. Certain news releases of key short-term statistics are presently sent under embargo, using private unencrypted email, to a limited number of news agencies about 30 minutes before the official dissemination time. Some of these short-term statistics are highly market sensitive and should therefore be made public to all users at the same time. Therefore, this pre-release access cannot be seen as either well justified or controlled.

To comply with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

11. INE should discontinue the practice of giving pre-release access to news agencies. (Compliance-relevant: ES CoP, Indicator 6.7)

The Other National Authorities reviewed all have release calendars. Nevertheless, a daily time for dissemination is not indicated for any of them. This is considered as a gap in the transparency of the dissemination of official statistics. At the same time, INE monitoring is needed for the remaining Other National Authorities developing, producing and disseminating official statistics.

To comply with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

12. The three Other National Authorities reviewed (the Subdirectorate General for Analysis, Coordination and Statistics in the Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, the Subdirectorate General for Foresight, Strategy and Energy Regulations in the Ministry for Ecological Transition and Demographic Challenge, the Subdirectorate General for Economic Studies and Statistics in the Ministry of Transport, Mobility and Urban Agenda) developing, producing and disseminating official statistics should indicate a standard daily time for the release of their statistics. INE should monitor the situation in the remaining Other National Authorities developing, producing and disseminating official statistics. (Compliance-relevant: ES CoP, Indicators 6.5 and 13.2)

INE regularly monitors response burden. In recent years INE has reduced the response burden imposed by several surveys, while maintaining full compliance with EU regulations. This important information is, at present, not easily accessible to users.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

13. INE should publish the response burden of all surveys on its website and include it in the National Statistical Plan. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicator 9.2)

V.   Improving quality and methodology

The peer review team noted that INE has produced standardised methodological reports and metadata for users. There are also instruments for coordinating the Spanish statistical system in terms of methodological issues. However, there might be a certain lack of clarity on these two issues. It was reported to the peer review team that the information on updates of methodological reports is not visible to users. In addition, the mechanisms for coordinating methodological issues in the Spanish statistical system could benefit from more transparency.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

14. INE should regularly inform users on updates to methodological information and improve the information about the mechanisms and procedures for coordinating methodological issues in the Spanish statistical system. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicators 6.4, 8.4 and 15.1)

INE has endeavoured to check the quality of important statistical products and there is high awareness about quality, which is also recognised by users. On the other hand, the peer review team learned that there are no systematic reviews of process quality. The existence of such reviews and the inclusion of external experts in such assessments is seen as essential in order to be compliant with the ES CoP.

To comply with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

15. INE should introduce systematic quality audits of statistical products involving external experts as appropriate. (Compliance-relevant: ES CoP, Indicators 4.3 and 4.4)

INE has conducted user satisfaction surveys at three-year intervals, the most recent having taken place in 2019. Follow-up actions were defined. The peer review team learned that it is not clear whether INE will continue this practice. However, the opinions of users and possible follow-up actions are an important stimulus to improving the quality and dissemination of statistical products.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

16. INE should guarantee that users have adequate possibilities to provide feedback on a regular basis. The feedback should be analysed and the findings used to develop plans to improve the quality of its products and the usability of its outputs. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicators 11.3 and 4.3)

The peer review team welcomed the existence of a specialised working group on seasonal adjustment, providing guidelines and standardised approaches on this important issue to relevant staff in the office. However, it was reported that for other important methodological topics (for instance, imputation or various estimations), the decision on the choice of methods and/or whether the methodology unit should be consulted is taken on an individual basis. Given this situation, INE senior management should encourage experts in statistical domains to contact the methodology unit.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

17. INE should extend the successful approach to the coordination of seasonal adjustment activity to other methodological areas. Expertise from the methodology unit should be applied to all topics relevant for statistical methodology. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicator 7.1)

The peer review team saw evidence that INE makes efforts to systematically implement the adapted Generic Statistical Business Process Model. Standardised descriptions have been collected for the majority of processes. The peer review team was told that the project is currently not progressing due to a lack of resources and a high variance in the statistical operations.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

18. INE should complete the description of all processes of the Generic Statistical Business Process Model and develop quality guidelines for all its level and phases. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, indicators 8.4 and 4.2)

VI.   Increasing the use of administrative data

Some administrative data are not suitable for use for statistical purposes due to the use of non-statistical classifications. As a consequence, some additional tasks have to be carried out by INE and Other National Authorities to make these data usable for statistical purposes. To make these administrative data more suitable for statistical purposes, statistical classifications should be applied where appropriate. In this respect, legislative change may be required.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

19. The Ministry of Economic Affairs and Digital Transformation, in close cooperation with INE, should amend existing legislation or introduce new legal provisions for applying European and national statistical classifications in administrative data where appropriate. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicators 8.1 and 2.2)

INE makes constant efforts to improve the accessibility and usability of administrative data. Contacts are fostered and, when necessary, there are efforts to sign adequate agreements. However, there is no systematic procedure to give feedback to holders of administrative data about quality issues in their administrative data.

 To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

20. INE and administrative data holders should create a system for providing feedback about data quality issues. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicator 8.7)

The Spanish statistical system intensively uses the administrative data held in a range of administrative registers or generated by other holders of administrative records. Nevertheless, to make administrative data more suitable for statistical purposes, the statistical authorities should be involved from the beginning when administrative registers and other sources are designed, modified or discontinued. There is no specific legislation on the obligation to consult the statistical authorities.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

21. INE and the Ministry of Economic Affairs and Digital Transformation should amend the relevant legal provisions in order to make it mandatory for holders of administrative records and registers, which are or may be used for statistical purposes, to inform INE about the specifications of and planned changes to the registers. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicators 2.2 and 8.7)

In the spirit of continuous improvement integral to the European Statistical System (ESS), the NSI will interpret the recommendations formulated in this report into improvement actions for implementation within the national statistical system (NSS).

2. INTRODUCTION

It is recognised that quality is one of the European Statistical System's (ESS) comparative advantages in a world experiencing a growing trend of instant information and new challenges, driven by exceptional circumstances or the continuous need for faster but quality-assured data. The European Statistics Code of Practice (ES CoP) is the cornerstone of the ESS common quality framework, and the ESS statistical authorities have committed themselves to adhere to it.

In this context, it is crucial for the ESS to be equipped with a review mechanism, the peer reviews, supporting with credible evidence this self-commitment to adhere to the ES CoP. The objective of this review mechanism is to enhance the integrity, professional independence and accountability of the ESS statistical authorities. The first round of peer reviews was carried out in 2006-2008, followed by a second round in 2013-2015.

In 2017, the ES CoP was reviewed and extended and now encompasses 16 principles. This revised version of the ES CoP triggered a third round of peer reviews, being carried out in the Member States of the European Union and of the European Free Trade Association (EFTA), and Eurostat from 2021 to mid-2023. This round of peer reviews aims at improving the quality and trust in European statistics by assessing the compliance of the ESS with the principles of the revised ES CoP. The peer reviews cover the ESS statistical authorities (Eurostat, the National Statistical Institutes (NSIs) and selected Other National Authorities (ONAs)) developing, producing and disseminating European statistics. The peer reviews will be followed by a period of annual monitoring of the implementation of the improvement actions developed by the NSIs to address the recommendations laid down in the peer review reports.

The third round of peer reviews has the following two objectives:

- To review the compliance/alignment of the ESS with the ES CoP, in order to demonstrate to the ESS and to external stakeholders that the ESS is a system based on the principles of the ES CoP;
- To help NSIs, ONAs and Eurostat in their further improvement and development by indicating future-oriented recommendations; at the same time they should stimulate government authorities to support the implementation of these recommendations.

Each peer review is conducted by a team of four statistical experts (both from inside and outside the ESS). The peer review has four phases: completion of the Self-Assessment Questionnaires (SAQs) by a country; analysis of these SAQs by the peer review team; a country visit by the peer review team; and the preparation of the final report and ensuing recommendations by the peer review team. These recommendations are of two types:

- Compliance-relevant (ensuring compliance/alignment with the ES CoP);
- Improvement-related (less critical/technical supporting improvements).

A combination of an audit-like and a peer review approach is used when assessing the national statistical systems (NSS) in the countries to benefit from the positive aspects of both approaches. The audit-like approach requires the provision of documents as evidence, the ownership of the recommendations by the peer review expert team, and the right for the NSIs to express diverging views on the recommendations and to formulate the corresponding improvement actions. Whereas the peer review approach allows for common agreement within the ESS on the methodology, the objectives, scope and implementation arrangements, the focus on improvements and a peer learning process.

Although all principles of the ES CoP will be reviewed for all countries through the SAQ, the peer review experts are free to customise the country visit to concentrate on those principles where more

clarification/explanation is needed. However, certain principles such as those concerning professional independence and coordination and cooperation, as well as principles including elements of modernisation, will be assessed during the peer review visit for every member of the ESS.

In addition to the common principles to be addressed for every member of the ESS, the peer review team also placed emphasis on the principles of Adequacy of Resources, Impartiality and Objectivity, Cost Effectiveness and Relevance.

Adequacy of resources (ES CoP principle 3) was identified as extremely important for ensuring human, financial and IT resources to increase INE's competitiveness in the labour market and to reduce the need for outsourcing. This seems necessary to guarantee adequate resourcing for the performance of important innovation projects.

The peer review team also focused on Impartiality and Objectivity (ES CoP principle 6) with respect to pre-release practices, transparency in disseminating information on the response burden and changes in the methodological reports.

More attention has also been given to Cost Effectiveness (ES CoP principle 10), to encourage INE to review its organisational structure and coordinate the statistical arrangements in responsible ministries to develop common standards, make more effective use of administrative data and use harmonised statistical tools.

Relevance (ES CoP principle 11) was also an additional topic in this peer review in respect of evaluation and strengthening the role of external user groups for developing plans to improve the quality and increase the usability of statistical outputs.

Also, although the reports should not be used to compare one country to another, much effort has been made to ensure the harmonisation of the reports and the ensuing recommendations across the countries so that all countries are treated equitably.

The peer review of Eurostat was conducted by the European Statistical Governance Advisory Board (ESGAB).

3. BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF THE NATIONAL STATISTICAL SYSTEM

Legislation

Spain is territorially divided into 17 autonomous regions and two autonomous cities. An autonomous region is a territorial entity which, under the Spanish Constitution, has its own legislative and executive powers and is governed by its own representatives. The structure of the Spanish state in the autonomous communities is dealt with in the Spanish Constitution of 1978. While the country is highly decentralised regarding administrative and governing competence, the production of official national and European statistics is the task of the central institutions of Government and is not devolved to the communities. The autonomous communities operate their own statistical offices focusing on statistics for their own territories. There is some cooperation between these statistical offices and the central Government, and the statistics of the autonomous regions are mostly harmonised with official national statistics in order to reduce the statistical burden. For the purpose of this peer review, however, the Central Statistical Bodies of the Autonomous Communities were not considered as part of the Spanish (Central) statistical system.

The Spanish constitution, in its Article 149.1.3, provides that "the State shall have exclusive jurisdiction over statistics for State purposes." The Law of 12/1989 on the Public Statistical Function (LFEP) is based on this constitutional provision. It establishes the National Statistical Institute (INE) as the central body of official statistics in Spain and assigns to it the status of an autonomous agency. Other official producers are statistical units belonging to certain ministries and the Bank of Spain. The LFEP lays down the principles governing statistical activities such as data collection, data processing and dissemination. It defines the conditions under which it is mandatory to supply data, regulates statistical confidentiality and statistical planning and specifies the national and international cooperation of the state services in the field of statistics.

Organisation

The Royal Decree 508/2001, amended by Royal Decree 176/2015, introduced INE's present organisational structure and approved its Charter and its Statute.

The Governing Board is formed by senior managers of the Presidency of INE, the Directorate General for Statistical Coordination and Labour and Price Statistics, the Directorate General for Statistical Products, the Department for the Monitoring of Statistical Production and Sampling, the Department for Methodology and Statistical Production Development, the National Accounts Department, the General Secretariat and the Office of the President.

As a supporting body of the Governing Board, the Commission of Sub-Directors General comprises all the sub-directors general in INE and discusses matters submitted for its consideration by the President.

The structure of INE includes its territorial units (provincial delegations and the Ceuta and Melilla delegations), which report to INE's President although they are organisationally dependent of the delegations of the Ministry of Economic Affairs and Digital Transformation.

There are three bodies at national level, the High Council of Statistics (CSE), the Interministerial Statistics Commission (CIME) and the Interregional Statistics Committee (CITE).

- CSE is a strong forum for user consultations and has an external advisory function. It proposes the content of a new 4-year National Statistical Plan (NSP), issues an opinion on the draft NSP

and on all proposals to introduce new statistics laid before it; it also draws up recommendations and deals with consultations.

- CIME is responsible for the horizontal coordination of the activities of the Central Government's statistical units.
- CITE, as a joint collegiate body, oversees statistical coordination, cooperation and standardisation between the statistical producers within the Central Government and the Central Statistical Bodies of the 17 autonomous communities of Spain. CITE's overall mission is to support coordination and cooperation among central and regional statistical bodies.

Appointment procedures for the head of the NSI

According to Article 28 of the LFEP, the President of INE is appointed by the Government under a Royal Decree on the proposal of the Minister of Economy (Ministry of Economic Affairs and Digital Transformation). Article 5 of INE's Statute stipulates that the President of INE has the rank of Under-Secretary. The principles governing access to the public administration are recognised in the Spanish Constitution and in the Law implementing the Basic Statute of Public Employees and in the Public Sector Legal System Law (LRJSP). Articles 55 and 63.3 of the LRJSP provide that every Under-Secretary is selected from career civil servants of the highest qualification (PhD, bachelor or equivalent required) that are honourable and have proper training and experience in the matter depending on the position. According to Law 3/2015 on the tenure of office for high-level officials of the State General Administration, academic background and professional experience for office responsibilities are mandatory to be taken into account for their appointment. In evaluating professional experience, special attention is paid to the nature, complexity and level of responsibility of the positions held, which are related to the content and functions of the position for which the person is to be appointed. They are also subject to the causes of removal stated by general laws based on the nature of civil servant status or on the performance of his/her duties.

Statistical Programmes

Law 12/1989 on the Public Statistical Function prescribes that the National Statistical Plan (NSP) is the main instrument governing the statistical activities of the Spanish (Central) statistical system. The plan is effective for four years (the NSP 2021-2024 is currently in force). All statistical products included are classified as statistics for central government purposes. Statistics that are driven by European legislation are automatically included in the NSP.

The NSP lays down the strategic lines of actions to guide and prioritise statistical production for central government purposes throughout its term of effect and the programme of expenditure needed to perform statistical duties for the four-year period.

The NSP is passed into law by a Royal Decree and published in the Bulletin Official del Estado (the central government gazette, or BOE). Once passed, the plan is updated by its annual implementing programmes.

Resources

In 2021, INE had 3,034 staff members (of whom 720 were stationed at the head office and 2,314 in provincial delegations). INE's staff consisted of 1,127 officials (37.2%) and 1,907 non-officials (62.8%). Most of the non-civil servant employees were concentrated in provincial delegations. The majority of the staff was permanent (98.3%). 23.1% had higher education (including PhD). The budget has been stable over the last three years and amounted to approximately 233 million Euro in 2021.

Coordination of the National Statistical System

As the central body of government statistics in Spain, INE bears responsibility for a number of functions enshrined in Article 26 of the LFEP. These include coordination, monitoring and supervision of national statistical services, elaboration of the national statistical plan, supervision of compliance with statistical confidentiality provisions, the use of administrative data for statistical purposes and promotion of such use by other statistical units, management of international relations in statistical affairs and professional development of statistical staff.

Most of the Ministries have their own statistical units and the coordination function for all units is strongly supported by the Interministerial Statistics Commission.

Other National Authorities participating in this peer review

For this peer review, INE selected the following 3 out of 17 Other National Authorities (ONAs):

- Subdirectorate General for Analysis, Coordination and Statistics (Under-Secretariat for Agriculture, Fisheries and Food; Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food) - MAPA
- Subdirectorate General for Foresight, Strategy and Energy Regulations (Secretariat of State for Energy; Ministry for the Ecological Transition and the Demographic Challenge) - MITERD
- Subdirectorate General for Economic Studies and Statistics (Directorate General for Economic Planning and Budgets; Under-Secretariat for Transport, Mobility and Urban Agenda; Ministry of Transport, Mobility and Urban Agenda) - MITMA

MAPA is responsible for all agricultural statistics and runs its own statistical unit. MITERD compiles large parts of the energy statistics and MITMA is responsible for some products related to construction and road transport. All three ONAs are in continuous contact with INE and all contribute to the National Statistics Plan. The provisions of Article 10 of the LFEP also serve for ONAs as a legal basis for data access. All three ONAs publish their data on the Ministries' websites and have implemented a release calendar, but there is no coordinated harmonised daily time for releases.

Data Access

The legal basis for accessing data is set forth in Article 10 of the LFEP. Articles 10.1 and 10.2 of the LFEP state the power of statistical authorities to request data for statistical purposes from natural and legal persons, and their general obligation to provide these data. Article 10.3 states the same duty for all institutions and public entities of the central government, autonomous communities and local councils. Furthermore, it states that the officials charged with the custody of such sources must assist the statistical units as expeditiously as possible.

INE and the Other National Authorities use administrative data for a broad magnitude of statistical products. There are formal agreements with the most important administrative data holders and the Spanish (Central) statistical system can make use of an inventory of administrative data. The inventory of administrative sources contains details on 117 administrative sources used by INE and there are a total of 74 statistical products that use administrative sources as a unique or complementary source.

INE has established partnerships to access new data sources in private ownership that allows it to compile experimental statistics using new data sources. The partnerships enable the mutual exchange of knowledge at an expert level which results in new sources being taken into the regular production process when feasible.

Relations with users / Dissemination of statistical products and services

INE's dissemination policy states that it will publish all statistical results and methods in order to provide significant information needed for the decision-making process of citizens, companies, researchers, private and public organizations and public administrations. Results, together with the methodology of statistical outputs, are published on a pre-announced schedule of publication. INE uses its webpage, press releases and an output database (INE base) to disseminate data. Additionally, INE caters to requests for customised releases and microdata can be accessed for research purposes.

4. PROGRESS/ADVANCEMENT IN THE LAST FIVE YEARS

Increased use of administrative data

Relations with holders of administrative data were intensified through exchanging data, building partnerships with them and signing collaboration agreements with primary data providers. An inventory of administrative data holding standardised meta-information was also set up. Further on, it is planned to integrate administrative data in a project for an institutional data lake jointly with statistical data and other potential sources. New methods using machine learning techniques are used to combine administrative data and data collected from sample surveys. A consortium was established among Tax agencies, the Ministry of Social Security, the Bank of Spain, the Public Employment Service and INE to share data for research purposes.

Making use of new data sources

INE follows a policy of investigating the possible use of new data sources arising from technological development. In this sense, significant progress was achieved in access to privately held data by creating relations with data owners. This includes promising new data sources such as financial transaction data, mobile phone data, scanner data and web data. New data sources are also used to develop experimental statistics.

Improvement of the Quality Management System (QMS)

The peer review process and the implementation of improvement actions have provided a unique opportunity to improve different aspects of the QMS. The most relevant include the improvement of the efficiency of statistical production processes, improvement of the systems of links with users (participation of expert users in the evaluation of products), extending and improving the use and integration of administrative sources in INE's architecture. Furthermore, the exercise has contributed to a better knowledge and involvement of INE staff in the QMS development, as the peer review and the subsequent improvement actions have involved all departments.

Progress in standardising and improving the efficiency of statistical processes

A new statistical process model adapting GSBPM for the Spanish statistical system was implemented for all INE operations. Significant progress was made in designing and building a tool for storing, managing and querying metadata. This led to significant progress in consolidating a more efficient architecture and production model for the Spanish statistical system.

Increasing expertise and implementing innovation projects

In response to a need for new skills, there is a high ambition to hire statisticians with a strong orientation in data science, and a plan for training staff in new statistical methods was implemented. This plan aims to improve staff knowledge, develop the national data ecosystems and introduce new methods (e.g., automation of the statistical production processes) and new statistics (e.g., now-casting). A call for cooperation with universities in innovation and development was published in 2021. INE intensified cooperation within the ESS by participating in important European and international projects. Modernisation and innovation projects on infrastructure, new products, data sources and machine learning methods have been implemented or are underway.

Improvement in transparency, accessibility and clarity

Transparency about the publication policy for users was increased by publicising the reasons for delays in the schedules. Publishing the list of modifications to the previously announced calendar of releases has increased transparency about the publication policy for users. INE has also improved the planning of publications, reducing the number of modifications included in the calendar. In addition, the user information and transparency policy, operational data, reports and quality indicators are now published on the website for all statistical operations. New products helping users to analyse data that have been incorporated in the portfolio include infographics (static and dynamic) and dissemination through maps in a GIS system.

Main progress made by ONAs which participated in the previous peer review

The increase in the robustness of the operations carried out by the Subdirectorate General for Analysis, Coordination and Statistics (Under-Secretariat for Agriculture, Fisheries and Food; Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food), needs to be noted. This particularly relates to initiatives taken to reduce the respondent burden, assuring the availability of a motivated and competent staff with constantly improving qualifications, the publication of standard methodological reports and the introduction of a news-release calendar.

In conclusion, it can be said that the 2015 peer review contributed significantly to the modernisation of INE and the ONAs that participated in this process.

5. COMPLIANCE WITH THE CODE OF PRACTICE AND FUTURE ORIENTATION

5.1 STRENGTHS OF THE NSI AND THE PARTICIPATING ONAs IN RELATION TO THEIR COMPLIANCE WITH THE CODE OF PRACTICE

Use of administrative data

Spain has an effective and extensively developed system of administrative data. Current legislation gives the statistical authorities sufficient powers to address administrative data holders to request the statistical information required to execute the National Statistical Plan. A mandate to access administrative registers is also set out in the LFEP. Formal agreements have been signed and regular meetings are organised with data providers on new demands. (ES CoP indicators 8.6, 8.7).

The latest censuses demonstrate the growing use of administrative information in statistical production. With regard to reducing statistical burden and increasing cost-effectiveness, both the agricultural and the population and housing censuses were mainly based on administrative sources. (ES CoP indicators 8.6, 9.4, 10.3)

Planning and monitoring the use of human resources

COSPRO (Cost of Projects), developed by INE, is a powerful system enabling the evaluation of the human resources allocated to each project based on staff input. It supports planning, monitoring and bidding for resources. This information system allows the evaluation of the human resources dedicated to each project. It is based on a computer application in which INE workers self-complete their daily hours dedicated to each project. It also allows the planning, monitoring and justification of the subsidies that INE receives for its statistical production. INE also assesses the staff needs in each Provincial Delegation using a system of allocation of workload units to be managed by each employee per unit time. The comparison between the theoretical and actual staff is used to decide on the distribution of work among the Provincial Delegations. (ES CoP indicators 3.3, 3.4, 10.1)

Training of staff and users

INE makes a continuous effort to train its staff. The School of Statistics conducts a programme of informative training courses on statistical operations carried out in the Spanish statistical system, on methodological issues (seasonal adjustment, multivariate analysis, machine learning, etc.) and computer tools. The constant training of ONA staff, including the ESTP programme, and INE's activities are clearly visible. (ES CoP indicator 7.6)

The ONAs generally have well-structured statistical units equipped with high expertise. Most of the staff are recruited as graduates in relevant statistics-related subjects. The continued improvement of the statistical knowledge of the staff was noted by the peer review team. (ES CoP indicators 7.5, 7.7)

Statistical literacy has been part of INE's dissemination strategy for several years. EXPLICA is the literacy portal targeting the general public, students and teachers. Visual content is of great importance on this portal. Some content, such as the "Statistical pills" (short videos on statistical concepts and official statistics), are of considerable interest to users. INE's experience in developing these materials can be valuable for the ESS. INE, inter alia, also designed the [European Statistical Competition](#) that annually promotes the knowledge of European Statistics among secondary school students. (ES CoP indicators 15.6, 15.7)

A quality monitoring and reporting system

The actions coordinated or supervised by INE's Quality Committee involve all INE units in a monitoring system which makes them co-participate in decisions on issues of quality. Within the framework of this Committee, quality is ensured annually and reflected in a global report on the status and evaluation of the operations of each domain expert/business management unit of INE. A barometer of quality indicators is maintained. Also, the inventory of good practices and an updated repository of European statistics quality reports show a strong side of the quality monitoring system. (ES CoP indicators 4.1, 4.2)

Cooperation with the scientific community

Cooperation between INE and universities is broad and deep. There are signed agreements with 29 universities on internship programmes for undergraduate students. INE considers training in statistics as the primary pillar that ensures preparation for future producers and users of statistics and facilitates recruitment. The teaching of statistics at universities is organised at a high level with the involvement of INE staff. The training programmes, including EMOS, are well adapted to national statistics needs covering the main areas of official statistics, e.g., national accounts, government finance statistics, data science, etc. (ES CoP indicators 7.5, 7.7)

The other pillar of cooperation is the participation of universities in conducting INE development projects, research projects on topics relevant to society, establishing high-level accessibility to microdata, including remote access, and ensuring data confidentiality. The scientific community is represented at collegiate bodies, e.g. CSE, and can participate in the planning of the work of official statistics. (ES CoP indicators 5.6, 15.4)

Tools at all stages of the statistical process

INE has a versatile standardised tool for online data collection (Integración de la recogida de información y su administración, IRIA). It allows the collection of all information for any statistical operation with adequate quality controls. INE also manages a georeferenced address frame for surveys directed at the population and households. (ES CoP indicators 7.3, 9.3, 10.4)

INE demonstrates a willingness and ability to proactively decrease sample sizes to reduce costs while meeting user needs for various surveys, including those used to produce structural business statistics, labour force surveys and economic situation surveys. (ES CoP indicators 9.2, 10.4)

Well-established procedures for the treatment of errors are most important for the reliability and trustworthiness of the results published by official statistics. In this sense, the register of errors implemented by INE is a supportive instrument to analyse and react to errors in a comprehensive way. (ES CoP indicator 12.2)

INE publishes 180 user-oriented quality reports in ESMS format, the [Standardised Methodological Reports,](#) on its website (88% of them are also in English). This is useful as users can easily consult the metadata, with majority quality indicators being updated annually. (ES CoP indicators 4.3, 15.5)

Innovative practices

INE runs some innovative projects with private data providers. One of these relates to the use of supermarket scanner data to supplement existing estimates of food prices; these data have been used in the CPI and HICP since 2020. Another project relates to the use of mobile phone data as a source of information about mobility and tourism patterns, as well as credit card data used to estimate the

breakdown of Tourism Expenditure. These data are published as experimental statistics; INE evaluates the data quality before deciding whether they are suitable to be classified as official statistics.

INE has started to use new innovative methods such as machine learning to develop experimental statistical products, intending to move them into the official statistics portfolio.

INE has started to implement an innovative project called "Data Lake". The data lake includes a statistical data repository, administrative and other data, and metadata with integrated analysis tools to achieve important objectives such as supporting communication with regional offices and enabling access for internal production, facilitating significantly increased microdata access for researchers.

The Subdirectorate General for Analysis, Coordination, and Statistics (Under-Secretariat for Agriculture, Fisheries and Food; Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food) is proactively experimenting with new data sources. It is involved in a project using satellite data to assign crop types to geographic areas. This information is used to generate maps for the whole of Spain.

5.2   ISSUES AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.2.1 Improving the legal and institutional environment

According to Article 28 of the Law 12/1989 on the Public Statistical Function (LFEP), the President of the National Statistics Institute (INE) is appointed by the Government under a Royal Decree on the proposal of the Minister of Economy. Article 5 of INE's statute stipulates that the President of INE has the rank of Under-Secretary.

Article 55 of Law 40/2015 on the Legal System applicable to the Public Sector (LRJSP) provides that every Under-Secretary is selected from career civil servants of the highest level (group A1). This means that certain potential candidates, such as senior academics from private universities and people from the commercial sector, cannot apply. The peer review team sees this as an unnecessary exception to the principle of open competition.

In addition, the LFEP does not make it clear that candidates for the post of President should have an appropriate professional background. The peer review team considers that making such a requirement explicit in the LFEP would highlight the fact that the role of President of INE is unique in the country's administrative system, and would emphasise the commitment to candidates for the post of the President of INE being of the highest professional calibre.

The peer review team noted that recommendation 1 from the 2015 peer review of the Spanish statistical system – which stated that "The National Statistical Institute should carry out actions to promote the necessary legislative amendments, laying down clear provisions for the appointment and dismissal of the President of the National Statistical Institute, in line with the European statistics Code of Practice (European statistics Code of Practice, indicator 1.8)" – did not in fact lead to a change in the law.

Echoing this recommendation from the previous peer review report, and consistent with a press release[3] by the European Statistics Governance Advisory Body (ESGAB) expressing concern about developments in the Spanish National Statistical Institute, the peer review team sees merit in reviewing aspects of the statistics act (the Law of 12/1989 on the Public Statistical Function). This

---

[3]

https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/documents/34693/14833496/INE+Press+Release_final_for+the+website.pdf/e88f56ad-bc4d-045a-a96a-4b822bcf818b?t=1657028630363

should include setting out (and hence giving prominence to) the reasons for dismissal of the President, which are set out in Articles 63 and 64 of the Law of the Basic Statute of Public Employees (resignation, loss of Spanish nationality, disciplinary sanctions and disqualification from holding any public sector job).

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

R1. The Ministry of Economic Affairs and Digital Transformation should review the legal basis for the appointment of the President of INE to enable non-civil servants to be considered for appointment; in addition, the Law on the Public Statistical Function should highlight the reasons for dismissal of the President of INE in the sense of Regulation 223/2009. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicator 1.8)

Access to administrative data is provided for in Article 10(3) of the LFEP: "If statistical production requires the use of data from administrative sources, the bodies, authorities and officials charged with the custody of such sources must assist the statistical units as expeditiously as possible."

INE has formal "Collaboration agreements" for the supply of two main sources of administrative data, with the tax authorities (State Tax Administration Agency, the Tax Agencies of the Basque Country) and the Ministry of Social Security. It also has agreements with other relevant owners of administrative information, such as the Cadastre. All these agreements are published in the Spanish Official Gazette and are accessible through the "Transparency portal" of the Spanish Public Administration. They cover: data (to be transmitted), uses, timetables, confidentiality protection arrangements, security and other technical arrangements. In addition, the arrangement with the national Tax Agency refers to the Agency's interest in receiving statistical information from INE.

In other cases, administrative data are provided to INE by Ministries and agencies – for example, the Ministry for Transport – on an informal basis.

The peer review team considers that a systematic approach would help to guarantee the ongoing supply of data, provide an opportunity to ensure all relevant details were captured and, when published, provide full clarity about the ways on which administrative data are used for statistical purposes.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

R2. INE should coordinate the development of a comprehensive set of agreements with administrative data holders. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicator 8.6)

The High Council of Statistics is a consultative body of the state statistical services. Article 37(1) of the LFEP determines that "its membership, organisational structure and functioning shall be determined by implementing regulations". Article 37(2) states that the chair of the Council shall be the Minister of Economy and Finance. Article 37(3) specifies the broad categories of membership (such as unions, employer groups and academic groups) and also that each government ministry should be represented (as well as INE). Hence the Council comprises representatives of producers, users and respondents. Half the advisors on the Council represent unions, businesses and academia – respondents and users – and the other half represent government (producers).

The tasks of the Council include releasing opinions on the National Statistical Plan and annual plans, all statistical projects, and providing recommendations on the implementation of statistical confidentiality protection. This means that users are able to influence decisions about statistical methodology.

The Interministerial Statistics Commission represents, together with INE, all the statistical services that produce state (official) statistics, including European statistics. Article 36 of the LFEP states that its membership and functions shall be determined by implementing regulations. It has the general function of horizontally coordinating the activities of the various producers of state statistics and strengthening cooperation between them.

There are several consequences of these arrangements. First, the voice of users is diluted compared with that of producers in terms of representation in different governance groups. Second, the chair of the High Council – where methodological questions are discussed - is a Minister.

The peer review team notes that many countries have separate structures to represent the views of users and the views of producers, and that this is a model that should be considered in relation to the Spanish statistical system. The peer review team also considers that user input would be strengthened by the establishment of external user groups to capture the needs of, for example, businesses, academia and researchers, civil society and trade unions.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

R3. INE should review the role, membership, and operation of the High Council of Statistics to ensure that the needs of users – on topics relevant to them – can be more fully taken into account. This review should evaluate the role that external (and sectoral) user groups might play and how they might support the High Council of Statistics. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicator 11.1)

5.2.2 Improving organisation and structures

INE comprises the headquarters in Madrid and offices in each province – 52 in total. These report to the President of INE via a single contact point, who deals with technical questions, for example putting the provincial office in touch with a subject matter expert in the headquarters. There are no links between the provincial offices and the Central Statistical Bodies of the Autonomous Communities.

The provincial offices have both administrative and statistical responsibilities. The former include legal responsibility for the management of the Electoral Census and the Municipal Register of Inhabitants. The statistical responsibilities relate to data collection for household and business surveys, and to submission of the data to the headquarters for processing. However, in an era of increasingly digital and online data collection, this structure and process appear somewhat old-fashioned. The peer review team noted that there has already been a move towards greater flexibility with the establishment of seven Computer Assisted Telephone Interviewing (CATI) centres in different provinces to conduct surveys in different languages.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

R4. The Ministry of Economic Affairs and Digital Transformation should commission a review of the structure of INE, focusing in particular on the role of – and need for – the statistical activities of the provincial offices. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicators 10.2 and 10.4)

The 2021-24 National Statistical Plan notes that "the existence of at least one Centralised Statistical Unit in each Ministry producing official statistics is considered necessary to coordinate statistical activity within said body, and serve as a dialogue with other statistical services".

Some Ministries producing official statistics have centralised units – Ministerial Statistics Units (MSUs) – that support, among other things, the implementation of common standards about release practices, quality and user engagement, as well as taking steps to improve statistical coherence across all those individuals and teams that produce statistics. Other Ministries producing official statistics do not have

such centralised units: some have, for example, informal groups referred to as 'statistical commissions' or working groups, others have a single person who might not even be a statistician. Differences in approach are attributed to some Ministries having been created relatively recently.

While the organisation of statistical activity is the responsibility of the Ministry, it is important that arrangements are in place to ensure that the benefits associated with MSUs are enjoyed.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

R5. INE should coordinate a review of the statistical arrangements in those Ministries producing official statistics, which do not have a centralised statistical unit, to identify ways to strengthen user engagement, develop common standards, exploit administrative sources most effectively and use harmonised statistical tools. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicators 1bis.1 and 10.3)

INE's methodologists provide valuable advice on technical statistical issues to others within INE and to the Other National Authorities (ONAs) and the ONAs act in close collaboration with INE. There is a frequent, sometimes even continuous exchange on an expert level. ONAs can also contribute to the discussion in the relevant bodies of the system.

However, the peer review team sees some room for improvement in standardising procedures related to quality. The distinction between topics on which the advice of methodologists should be sought and topics where subject matter specialists might make their own decisions appears to be somewhat arbitrary, and the circumstances in which the advice should be sought have not yet been formally established. Doing so, and publishing the advice, would provide clarity about expectations to INE and each ONA.

Moreover, although protocols are in place for certain aspects of statistical activity, such as those related to the content of a number of statistical products, the establishment of more detailed protocols related to data transfer, statistical confidentiality thresholds, metadata and the use of standard classifications would improve the comparability of the statistics produced in the various organisations and would enhance coordination.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

R6. INE should work with the Other National Authorities developing, producing and disseminating official statistics to develop formal agreements covering mutual responsibilities in relation to data transfer, methodology and quality, statistical confidentiality thresholds, common standards, dissemination policy and user engagement. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicators 1bis.2, 3.1 and 7.2)

5.2.3 Optimising the use of resources

INE has highly qualified staff and participation in training programmes is facilitated. INE keeps track of the number of people of each category assigned to each unit. Job descriptions defining the tasks and the qualifications required are available for all positions and are known to staff. Furthermore, staff continuously record the type of time use per individual process and project in the COSPRO (Cost of Projects) information system. This makes it possible to evaluate the number of human resources allocated to each activity. However, there is no systematic human resources evaluation process to determine the assignment, performance and training needs of INE personnel. INE explained that staff performance evaluation systems have not as yet been developed in the Spanish Administration, and that INE has not unilaterally developed them.

The absence of office-wide guidelines for evaluating human resources jeopardises the possibility for INE to provide its staff with opportunities to broaden and deepen their expertise. In addition,

employees drawing up a career plan would benefit from regular interviews with their manager and feedback on their work performance. A system of staff appraisal based on communication with the staff would further allow talent management and ensure that both the career expectations of staff and the needs of INE are met. Therefore, the peer review team sees a need to improve communication with employees about their performance.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

R7. INE should consider establishing a standardised process of staff appraisals and a system for evaluating the performance of employees. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicators 7.6)

In recent years, INE has experienced a significant and continuous outflow of staff, either to other organisations or due to retirements. As part of its human resources monitoring, INE looks at staff mobility (including retirements) and the qualifications needing to be replaced or newly acquired (in conjunction with training of current staff). INE makes an annual request for the staff it needs (statistical staff, IT staff, administrative staff, etc.) to the Ministry of Territorial Policy and Public Function (having the centralised competence for hiring civil servants in the Spanish Administration), which decides on the allocation of resources to the various organisations. Every year this allocation is translated into a "Public Employment Offer" that defines the number of new positions for civil servants that each institute can hire through the competitive examination system. Although major efforts are devoted to attracting young graduates, certain profiles are difficult to recruit.

INE is ambitious about standardising processes and developing modern tools for its statistical work. Notably, the coordinated action of the methodology unit and the ICT unit makes it possible to share resources and investments and contributes to the identification of the potential for innovation and modernization to optimise statistical processes. However, there is frequently a need to outsource important tasks (particularly IT) because INE is not competitive enough in the labour market to hire staff with adequate competencies.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

R8. INE should increase its competitiveness in the labour market and consider improving the package offered to new recruits with the objective of reducing the need for outsourcing. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicators 3.1, 7.5 and 10.2)

INE and the Other National Authorities plan to implement many innovative projects. INE's plans enjoy broad support from the High Council of Statistics and other bodies. Resourcing is currently sufficient but resources dedicated to innovative projects which are not part of regular statistical production, can sometimes be vulnerable in times of financial hardship. Therefore, it seems important to uphold the level of resources for the medium and long term.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

R9. The Ministry of Economic Affairs and Digital Transformation should ensure that adequate resourcing is made available in the annual work programme to guarantee that the objectives of important innovation projects are achieved. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicators 3.1 and 3.2)

5.2.4 Improvement of dissemination

The 17 Autonomous Communities have each passed separate territorial Laws on Public Statistical Functions regulating their statistical activities. However, this regional statistical activity does not form part of the Spanish (Central) statistical system. Currently, 16 of the Central Statistical Bodies of the Autonomous Communities (OCECA) receive information from INE under embargo, both relating to

their territory and to the national total, for the purpose of preparing and publishing news releases relating to their respective territorial scopes in a synchronised manner with INE.

The peer review team noted that the OCECA are governed by laws and regulations which guarantee statistical confidentiality and that they have also signed a Multilateral Working Agreement with INE for developing cooperation on statistical matters. Embargoed information is sent to the OCECA through a user/password on a secure network run by the public administration. Moreover, the agreement signed with the OCECA establishes provisions to sanction leaks of embargoed information. However, this degree of pre-release access to bodies outside the Spanish (Central) statistical system cannot be seen as being of limited scope.

To comply with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

R10. INE should reconsider the practice of giving the Central Statistical Bodies of the Autonomous Communities pre-release information under embargo. (Compliance-relevant: ES CoP, Indicator 6.7)

INE has a clear policy for pre-release access, which is made public on its website. Certain news releases of key short-term statistics are presently sent under embargo, using private unencrypted email, to a limited number of news agencies about 30 minutes before the official dissemination time. Some of these short-term statistics are highly market sensitive and should therefore be made public to all users at the same time. This pre-release access cannot be seen as either well justified or controlled.

To comply with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

R11. INE should discontinue the practice of giving pre-release access to news agencies. (Compliance-relevant: ES CoP, Indicator 6.7)

The Other National Authorities reviewed all have online release calendars. Nevertheless, a daily time for dissemination is not indicated for any of them. At the same time, INE monitoring is needed for the remaining ONAs regarding their dissemination of official statistics, and they should be encouraged to systematically pre-announce their statistical release dates and times.

To comply with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

R12. The three Other National Authorities reviewed (the Subdirectorate General for Analysis, Coordination and Statistics in the Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, the Subdirectorate General for Foresight, Strategy and Energy Regulations in the Ministry for Ecological Transition and Demographic Challenge, the Subdirectorate General for Economic Studies and Statistics in the Ministry of Transport, Mobility and Urban Agenda)developing, producing and disseminating official statistics should indicate a standard daily time for the release of their statistics. INE should monitor the situation in the remaining Other National Authorities developing, producing and disseminating official statistics. (Compliance-relevant: ES CoP, Indicators 6.5 and 13.2)

INE regularly monitors response burden. Regarding business surveys, a directory of sampling units is set up every year, which enables INE to observe the statistical burden on each unit selected in any economic survey. There is also a strategy for coordinating samples to avoid an excessive load on medium and small companies due to the possible coincidence of various surveys on the same company. Regarding household surveys, a directory containing information on the households which have been selected in one of the year's surveys is maintained and updated, thus avoiding the same respondent unit being reselected over a three-year period.

In recent years, INE has reduced the response burden imposed by several surveys, while maintaining full compliance with EU regulations. This important information is, at present, not easily accessible to users.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

R13. INE should publish the response burden of all surveys on its website and include it in the National Statistical Plan. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicator 9.2)

5.2.5 Improving quality and methodology

The Spanish statistical system already shows a high degree of compliance with the ES CoP with respect to principle 4 (Commitments to Quality) and the principles related to statistical outputs 11 to 15. The same holds for the indicators related to methodology laid down in principles 7 and 8.

INE has drawn up Quality Guidelines on how to apply quality assurance elements related to the statistical production process that can be consulted on its website. A project to implement the Generic Statistical Production Process Model (GSBPM) adapted to the requirements of INE has been started. One central objective is to develop process-oriented quality guidelines.

The organisational structure of INE includes a Department for Methodology and Statistical Production Development, which provides guidelines for very important process steps related to statistical methodology. The department can be contacted if a methodological problem or task arises and INE has set up a working group on seasonal adjustment. Methodological issues are also discussed in and approved by the three main bodies in the Spanish statistical system (CSE, CIME and CITE).

The peer review team noted that INE has implemented the production of important metadata for users. There are also instruments for coordinating the Spanish statistical system concerning methodological issues. However, the mechanisms to inform users on updates of metadata could be improved.

By developing and disseminating Standardised Methodological Reports, a specific web section of methodology for every statistical product and the continuous information included in news releases, a well-established concept for providing metadata for users is available. It was reported to the peer review team that the information on updates of methodological reports is not visible to users. In addition, the mechanisms for coordinating methodological issues in the Spanish statistical system could benefit from more transparency.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

R14. INE should regularly inform users on updates of methodological information and improve the information about the mechanisms and procedures for coordinating methodological issues in the Spanish statistical system. (Improvement-related; ES CoP, Indicators 6.4, 8.4 and 15.1)

The quality management system of INE is based on a set of different instruments, which are designed to serve as a framework for guaranteeing quality. This includes a policy for approving and following up standards for statistical work, which cover classifications, concepts and the European SDMX Metadata Structure (ESMS), and a system for the continuous specification and monitoring of quality indicators.

INE has endeavoured to check the quality of important statistical products and there is high awareness about quality, which is also recognised by users. On the other hand, the peer review team learned that there are no systematic reviews of the quality of processes. The existence of such reviews and to

inclusion of external experts in such assessments is seen as essential in order to be compliant with the ES CoP.

To comply with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

R15. INE should introduce systematic quality audits of statistical products involving external experts as appropriate. (Compliance-relevant: ES CoP, Indicators 4.3 and 4.4)

INE has conducted user satisfaction surveys at three-year intervals since 2007, the most recent being in 2019. These surveys are designed in accordance with the model of surveys carried out by Eurostat and follow the recommendations and definitions of the European Statistics Code of Practice (last version 2017). The aim of these surveys is to learn about users' statistical information needs and to measure the level of user satisfaction with the quality of the products and services regarding official statistics.

The peer review team learned that it is not clear whether INE will continue this practice. However, the opinions of users and possible follow-up actions are an important stimulus to improving the quality and the dissemination of statistical products.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

R16. INE should guarantee that users have adequate possibilities to provide feedback on a regular basis. The feedback should be analysed and the findings used to develop plans to improve the quality of its products and the usability of its outputs. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicators 11.3 and 4.3)

There is a high degree of expertise regarding methodological knowledge within INE and a specialised department anchored in its organisation guarantees that support is provided whenever consulting is needed.

The peer review team welcomed the existence of a specialised working group on seasonal adjustment, providing guidelines and standardised approaches on this important issue to relevant staff in the office. However, it was reported that for other important methodological topics (such as imputation), the decision on the choice of methods and/or whether the methodology unit should be consulted is taken on an individual basis. Given this situation, INE senior management should encourage experts in statistical domains to contact the methodology unit

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

R17. INE should extend the successful approach to the coordination of seasonal adjustment activity to other methodological areas. Expertise from the methodology unit should be applied to all topics relevant for statistical methodology. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicator 7.1)

Following a recommendation of the 2015 peer review, INE identified steps related to adapting the GSBPM model to INE's needs.

The peer review team saw evidence that INE makes efforts to systematically implement the adapted Generic Statistical Business Process Model (GSBPM). Standardised descriptions have been collected for the majority of processes. The peer review team was told that the project is currently not progressing due to a lack of resources and a high variance in the statistical operations.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

R18. INE should complete the description of all processes of the Generic Statistical Business Process Model and develop quality guidelines for all its levels and phases. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, indicators 8.4 and 4.2)

5.2.6 Increasing the use of administrative data

The use of administrative data is the main pillar for input into the production chain in the Spanish statistical system. Article 26(f) of LFEP states that INE can use data from administrative sources for statistical purposes and promotes such use by other central government statistical units. Following the recommendations of the 2015 peer review there have been significant improvements regarding the use of administrative sources. For most of the relevant sources there are agreements with the institution holding the data. An inventory of all administrative data was created and such data will also contribute to an important data lake project.

There is no specific legislation regarding the obligation to consult the statistical authorities when setting up, developing or withdrawing administrative registers. Nevertheless, cooperation with managers of the most relevant sources of information is ongoing.

Some administrative data are not suitable for use for statistical purposes due to the use of non-statistical classifications. The peer review team sees room for improvement and, in order to make these administrative data more suitable for statistical purposes, statistical classifications should be applied where appropriate. In this respect, legislative change may be required.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

R19. The Ministry of Economic Affairs and Digital Transformation, in close cooperation with INE, should amend existing legislation or introduce new legal provisions for applying European and national statistical classifications in administrative data where appropriate. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicators 8.1 and 2.2)

INE has been making constant efforts to improve the accessibility and usability of administrative data. Contacts are fostered and, when necessary, there are efforts to sign adequate agreements. However, there are no standardised systematic procedures in the communication line between INE and administrative data holders.

Specifically, there is no systematic procedure to give feedback to holders of administrative data about quality issues in their administrative data sources.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

R20. INE and administrative data holders should create a system for providing feedback about data quality issues. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicator 8.7)

The national statistical system intensively uses the administrative data held in a range of administrative registers or generated by other holders of administrative records. Nevertheless, to make administrative data more suitable for statistical purposes, the statistical authorities should be involved from the beginning when administrative registers and other sources are designed, modified, or discontinued. There is no specific legislation on the obligation to consult statistical authorities.

To improve beyond compliance with the ES CoP, the peer review team recommends:

R21. INE and the Ministry of Economic Affairs and Digital Transformation should amend the relevant legal provisions in order to make it mandatory for holders of administrative records and registers,

which are or may be used for statistical purposes, to inform INE about the specifications of and planned changes to the registers. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicators 2.2 and 8.7)

5.3 VIEWS OF THE NSI, AS THE NATIONAL COORDINATOR OF THE NSS AND THE PEER REVIEW, ON THOSE RECOMMENDATIONS WHERE THEY DIVERGE FROM PEER REVIEW EXPERTS' ASSESSMENT

INE Spain acknowledges the work done by the peer review team and its effort to understand such a complex administrative system as the Spanish public sector. Notwithstanding this, some of the recommendations made show that we may not have been able to explain exactly how the Spanish public administration works, the rules governing the whole system or the details of INE activity. All these reasons justify INE's diverging views as regards some of the recommendations.

Recommendations where INE Spain has a diverging view will be listed in the order of numbering in the report.

1) R1. The Ministry of Economic Affairs and Digital Transformation should review the legal basis for the appointment of the President of INE to enable non-civil servants to be considered for appointment; in addition, the Law on the Public Statistical Function should highlight the reasons for dismissal of the President of INE in the sense of Regulation 223/2009. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicator 1.8)

The recommendation on the selection of candidates for the position of President of INE among civil servants of group A1 is fixed by a National Law on the Legal Regime of the National Public Sector[4], which is beyond the statistical legislation. This would render the first part of the recommendation virtually impossible to fulfil by the Spanish statistical system, since it would embrace legal issues about the whole National Public Sector beyond the official statistics context and affecting the entire civil service in Spain. Furthermore, in our view, professional independence of the statistical office is reinforced by restricting the selection to civil servants, among which many professors, researchers, and professionals with a strong background in statistics and data analysis can be found.

It should also be noted that several places in this report mention an ESGAB document, whose publication date is after the peer review meetings between experts and national participants, and which therefore could not be discussed, making a speculative statement.

2) R4. The Ministry of Economic Affairs and Digital Transformation should commission a review of the structure of INE, focusing in particular on the role of – and need for - the statistical activities of the provincial offices. (Improvement-related: ES CoP, Indicators 10.2 and 10.4)

Provincial offices do actually play a relevant role in the Spanish statistical system beyond their responsibilities in data collection and data editing of different statistics. They are legally assigned a role for the administrative and technical management of the Electoral Register and the Municipal Register of Inhabitants, according to regulations LO 5/1985, L 7/1985 and RD 390/1998, and RD 1690/1986. In this line, the relevance of the aforementioned tasks which moreover are foreseen at the level of organic law, which is the highest legal rank provided for in the Spanish legal system, means that this recommendation can only be understood in the sense of continuing the ongoing efforts regarding reorganization and improving the efficiency of the provincial offices. In the current Spanish legal and administrative context, their need is beyond discussion.

.

---

[4] In Spanish, *Ley 40/2015, de 1 de octubre, de Régimen Jurídico del Sector Público* (https://www.boe.es/buscar/act.php?id=BOE-A-2015-10566).

3) R10. INE should reconsider the practice of giving the Central Statistical Bodies of the Autonomous Communities pre-release information under embargo. (Compliance-relevant: ES CoP, Indicator 6.7)

According to the Spanish Constitution, the state has exclusive competence in statistics for state purposes and the statutes of autonomy of the autonomous communities, which are state laws at the highest level, establish their competence for statistics in their territorial scope and to collaborate in statistics of supra-autonomous scope, being therefore, part of the Spanish statistical system. Specifically, the Law on the Public Statistical Function establishes a strong link between INE and the Statistical Institutes of the Autonomous Communities, as stated in its articles 6 and 41.4.

The Statistical Institutes of the Autonomous Communities develop statistical work programmes in their territories that, on numerous occasions, coincide with the National Statistical Plan. In order to avoid duplicities, agreements are established between INE and the autonomous institutes, to overcome the disadvantages of possible duplications, such as the increase in the response burden. Those agreements include that the result of the operations carried out by INE will be provided to the autonomous institutes under embargo.

The transmission of information to the Statistical Institutes of the Autonomous Communities under embargo allows them to enrich the information generated at national level, together with the fact that they are statistical bodies and therefore subject to the same legal principles on statistical secrecy. Exchanges of information between INE and each regional institute (and consequently this transfer of embargoed data) are covered by perfectly detailed agreements and documents. This agreement works properly and avoids duplication of efforts, resources and conflicts between potentially contradicting duplicated statistical outputs, thus making it convenient to maintain the dissemination policy in this area.

4) R11. INE should discontinue the practice of giving pre-release access to news agencies. (Compliance-relevant: ES CoP, Indicator 6.7)

The pre-release practice is normal in many statistical offices, including Eurostat[5]. It is a well justified practice, fully under INE's control, and compatible with the ES CoP.

The objective of sending press releases under embargo to a small number of news agencies is that they have enough time to prepare their information and to review the data they are going to publish. This minimizes the risk of competition among news agencies to provide information as soon as possible, making mistakes when disseminating INE data. Therefore, we believe that the embargo offers positive results, since it prevents errors in disseminating information to society as a whole and it is in accordance with the ES CoP

The constant monitoring that exists between the agencies, as well as INE's control mechanisms, constitute sufficient guarantees against disclosures ahead of the publication time. Above all, a self-controlling mechanism exists since they run the risk of being penalized and, therefore, of not having access to the embargoed information compared to their competitors.

---

[5]https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/documents/4187653/5797673/IMPARTIAL_ACCESS_2012_OCT-EN.PDF.pdf/9526a103-275c-4c39-b0b3-44abf47add6c

ANNEX A – AGENDA OF THE VISIT

Timing	Topic	Participants
Day 1 - 30 May 2022		

09.00-09:45	Preparatory meeting	**The peer review expert team:**
		All
		
		The NSI:
		National peer review coordinator & Head of Quality
		National peer review coordination team:
		Quality & good practices unit:
		    Head of area of quality management
		    Head of area of user engagement
		    Head of section
		    Technician
		Deputy head, Coordination unit
		Head of service, Subdirectorate General for Statistical Dissemination

09:45-10.00	Welcome and introduction to the programme	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** President Director General for Statistical Coordination and Labour and Price Statistics Director General for Statistical Products Director of the Office of the President National peer review coordinator National peer review coordination team
10.00-11.00	Presentation of the National Statistical System	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** Director General for Statistical Coordination and Labour and Price Statistics Director General for Statistical Products Director of the Office of the President National peer review coordinator Head of area quality management, Quality & good practices unit Head of area of user engagement, Quality & good practices unit

11.00-11.15	Coffee break	
11.15-12.45	Professional independence and the Law on Official Statistics and related legislation (ES CoP principles 1, 2 and 6)	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** Director General for Statistical Coordination and Labour and Price Statistics Director of the Office of the President Deputy Director, Office of the President Deputy head, Coordination unit Legal adviser, Office of the President National peer review coordinator
12:45-13:45	Lunch	
13:45-15.15	Coordination and cooperation (ES CoP principle 1bis)	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** Director General for Statistical Coordination and Labour and Price Statistics Director of the Office of the President Deputy Director Deputy head, Coordination unit Head of area of international relations, Office of the President Legal adviser, Office of the President National peer review coordinator Head of area quality management, Quality & good practices unit Head of area of user engagement, Quality & good practices unit
15:15-15.30	Coffee break	
15:30-17:00	Programming, planning and resources (ES CoP principles 1, 3, 9 and 10)	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** Director General for Statistical Coordination and Labour and Price Statistics Deputy head, Coordination unit General Secretary, General Secretariat Deputy General Secretary, General Secretariat Director, Department for Monitoring Statistical Production and Sampling National peer review coordinator

		Head of area quality management, Quality & good practices unit
		Head of area of user engagement, Quality & good practices unit

Timing	Topic	Participants
Day 2 - 31 May 2022		
09:00-10:15	Quality (organisational structure, tools, monitoring) (ES CoP principles 4 and 11 to 14)	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** Head of unit, Quality & good practices Head of area, Quality & good practices Head of area, Quality & good practices Head of section, Quality & good practices Technician, Quality & good practices Director of the Department for Statistical Production Control and Sampling Deputy Director General, S.G Labour Market Statistics
10:15-10.30	Coffee break	
10.30-12:00	Dissemination and Confidentiality (ES CoP principles 5, 6 and 15)	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** Deputy Director General, Subdirectorate General for Statistical Dissemination Head of area, ICT Subdirectorate National peer review coordinator Head of area quality management, Quality & good practices unit Head of area of user engagement, Quality & good practices unit
12:00-13:00	Lunch	
13:00-14:45	Methodology, data collection, data processing and administrative data (ES CoP principles 2, 7 and 8)	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** Director of the Department for Methodology and Statistical Production Development Deputy head, Department for Methodology and Statistical Production Development Director, Department for Monitoring Statistical Production and Sampling National peer review coordinator Head of area quality management, Quality & good practices unit

		Head of area of user engagement, Quality & good practices unit
14:45-15:00	Coffee break	
15.00-16.15	Progress and plans for the future	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** Director General for Statistical Coordination and Labour and Price Statistics Deputy head, Coordination unit Director, Department for the Methodology and Statistical Production Development Deputy Head, Department for the Methodology and Statistical Production Development. National PR coordinator Head of area quality management, Quality & good practices unit Head of area of user engagement, Quality & good practices unit
16.15-17:15	Meeting with junior staff	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI junior staff:** Department for National Accounts General Secretariat S.G. for Data Collection S.G. for Environmental Agricultural and Financial Statistics S.G. for Socio-demographic Statistics S.G. for Statistical Dissemination S.G. for Tourism & R&D Statistics

Timing	Topic	Participants
Day 3 - 1 June 2022		
09.00-10.30	Meeting with ONA: Subdirectorate General for Analysis, Coordination and Statistics (Under-Secretariat for Agriculture, Fisheries and Food; Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food)	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** National peer review coordinator Head of area quality management, Quality & good practices unit Head of area of user engagement, Quality & good practices unit **Subdirectorate General for Analysis, Coordination and Statistics:** Deputy Director General Head of area Technical Adviser
10.30-10.45	Coffee break	
10.45-12.15	Meeting with ONA: Subdirectorate General for Foresight, Strategy and Energy Regulations (Ministry for the Ecological Transition and the Demographic Challenge)	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** National peer review coordinator Head of area quality management, Quality & good practices unit Head of area of user engagement, Quality & good practices unit **Subdirectorate General for Foresight, Strategy and Energy Regulations:** Deputy Director General Head of Planning and Statistical Methodology Area, Statistical Working Group (GTE) Head of Energy Statistics Area
12.15-13.15	Lunch	

13.15-14.45	Meeting with ONA: Subdirectorate General for Economic Studies and Statistics (Ministry of Transport, Mobility and Urban Agenda)	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** National peer review coordinator Head of area quality management, Quality & good practices unit Head of area of user engagement, Quality & good practices unit **Subdirectorate General for Economic Studies and Statistics:** Deputy Director general Head of area Head of area
14.45-15.00	Coffee break	
15:00-16.30	High Council on Statistics (HCS) and the Interterritorial Statistics Committee (CITE)	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** Director General for Statistical Coordination and Labour and Price Statistics Director of the Office of the President Deputy Director, Office of the President Head of area, Office of the President. National peer review coordinator **HCS & CITE members:** Spanish Society of Statistics and Operations Research, Institute of Data Science and Artificial Intelligence of the University of Navarre Director of Training, Employment, Projects and Agreements Foundation for Cooperation and the Social Inclusion of the Disabled (ONCE) Director of the Asturian Society for Economic and Industrial Studies, Principality of Asturias. Head of Judicial Statistics, High Council of the Judiciary

Timing	Topic	Participants
Day 4 – 2 June 2022		
09.00-10.30	Meeting with main data providers	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** National peer review coordinator **Main data providers:** Deputy Director General of statistics, State Tax Administration Agency Deputy Director of statistics, General Treasury of Social Security Deputy Director, Spanish Agricultural Guarantee Fund – Ministry of Agriculture Director of the research service, Spanish confederation of Employers' Organisations (CEOE) Assistant Director of the research service, Spanish confederation of Employers' Organisations (CEOE)
10.30-10.45	Coffee break	
10.45-11.15	Meeting with providers of new data sources (1) "Mobile phone data in tourism statistics"	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** Head of area, Subdirectorate General for Tourism, Science and Technology Statistics National peer review coordinator **Telefónica:** Head of Business Development for Spain at LUCA: Data-Driven Decisions (Big Data B2B Telefónica)
11.15- 11.45	Meeting with providers of new data sources (2) "Supermarket chain scanner data & CPI"	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** Deputy Director General, Subdirectorate General for Price and Household Budget Statistics. National peer review coordinator **Carrefour:** Department director

11.45-12.45	Meeting with main users - the media	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** Press Office Director National peer review coordinator **Media:** Europa Press Agency Mediaset España (Tele 5 – NIUS) International news agency
12.45-13.45	Lunch	
13.45-15.00	Meeting with main users – Ministries and other public/private institutions (including Central Bank as a user), the Interministerial Statistics Commission.	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** National peer review coordinator **Main users:** Director, Statistics department, Bank of Spain (member of the CIME) Deputy Director General for Studies, Analyses and Action Plans, Ministry of Industry (member of the CIME) Deputy Director General, Statistics and Studies Unit, Ministry of Education and Vocational Training (member of the CIME)
15.00-16.00	Meeting with main users – business associations and federations and trade unions, as well as representatives of a committee of users	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** National peer review coordinator **Main users:** Director of research Department, Spanish chamber of commerce, Director of the research department, "Labour commissions" (CCOO) Trade union General Secretary, ASEDIE, Multisectorial Information Association. Statistics Commission, ASEDIE

16.00-16.15	Coffee break	
16:15-17:15	Meeting with main users - the Scientific community	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** National peer review coordinator **Scientific community:** Full professor of statistics, University Carlos III of Madrid Full professor of mathematics, Vice-Rector for Academic Organisation, Complutense University of Madrid Associate professor of economics, Autonoma University of Madrid

Timing	Topic	Participants
Day 5 - 3 June 2022		
08.45-10.00	Peer review expert team discussion	
10.00-10.15	Coffee break	
10.15-11.15	Clarifications, remaining or additional issues and focus areas	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** National peer review coordinator Head of area quality management, Quality & good practices unit Head of area of user engagement, Quality & good practices unit
11.15-12.00	Meeting with the senior management of the ONAs: conclusions and recommendations	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** Senior management National peer review coordinator Head of area quality management, Quality & good practices unit Head of area of user engagement, Quality & good practices unit **ONAs:** Subdirectorate General for Analysis, Coordination and Statistics (Under-Secretariat for Agriculture, Fisheries and Food; Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food): - Deputy Director General - Coordinator of the Statistics Area - Head of the area, Technical Adviser Subdirectorate General for Foresight, Strategy and Energy Regulations (Ministry for the Ecological Transition and the Demographic Challenge: - Deputy Director General, Subdirectorate General for Foresight, Strategy and Energy Regulations - Head of Planning and Statistical Methodology Area, Statistical Working Group (GTE)

		- Head of Energy Statistics Area, Subdirectorate General for Foresight, Strategy and Energy Regulations <u>Subdirectorate General for Economic Studies and Statistics (Ministry of Transport, Mobility and Urban Agenda):</u> - Deputy Director General - Head of Area - Head of Area
12.00-13.00	Lunch	
13.00-14.30	Meeting with the senior management of the NSI: conclusions and recommendations.	**The peer review expert team:** All **The NSI:** President Director General for Statistical Coordination and Labour and Price Statistics Director General for Statistical Products Director of the Department for Statistical Production Control and Sampling Director of the Department for Methodology and Statistical Production Development Director of the Office of the President General Secretary National peer review coordinator Head of area quality management, Quality & good practices unit Head of area of user engagement, Quality & good practices unit

ANNEX B – LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

National Statistics Institute (INE):

- National peer review coordinator:
  Agustín Cañada, Deputy Director General, Quality & good practices

- Board of Directors:
  Juan-Manuel Rodríguez Poo, President
  Miguel-Ángel De Castro, Director General for Statistical Coordination and Labour and Price Statistics
  Alfredo Cristóbal, Director General for Statistical Products
  Carlos Ballano, Director, Department for Monitoring Statistical Production and Sampling
  Miguel-Ángel Martínez, Director, Department for Methodology and Statistical Production Development
  Antonio Salcedo, Director, Office of the President
  Ángeles Sebastián, General Secretariat, General Secretary

- Other INE units
  Joaquin Agurruza, Head of area, ICT Subdirectorate
  Julia Bermejo, Head of service, S.G. for Socio-demographic Statistics
  Aurora Calvente, Head of service, S.G. for Environmental, Agricultural and Financial Statistics
  Ana Cánovas, Head of area, Office of the President
  Damián Carrera, Technician, Quality & good practices
  Juan Cervigón, Head of service, Subdirectorate General for Statistical Dissemination
  Diego Cruz, Head of section, Quality & good practices
  Begoña De-la-Campa, Deputy General Secretary, General Secretariat
  Adolfo Gálvez, Deputy Director General, Subdirectorate General for Statistical Dissemination
  Miguel-Ángel García, Deputy Director General, S.G Labour Market Statistics
  Yolanda Gómez, Legal adviser, Office of the President
  Elena González, Head of area, S.G. for Tourism, Science and Technology Statistics
  Ignacio González, Deputy Director General, Subdirectorate General for Price and Household Budget Statistics.
  Laura Grande, Head of service, General Secretariat
  Javier López, Head of service, Subdirectorate General for Statistical Dissemination
  Rafael López, Head of area, Department for National Accounts
  Ángeles Lora, Deputy Head, Coordination unit
  Suelí Lorenzo, Deputy Head, Department for Methodology and Statistical Production Development
  Cristina Maestro, Head of service, S.G. for Data Collection
  Miguel-Ángel Menéndez, Head of service, Department for National Accounts
  Luisa Muñoz, Head of area of user engagement & auditing, Quality & good practices
  Pilar Ordás, Head of area, Office of the President
  Irene Pedrayes, Head of service, Department for National Accounts
  Donald Peña, Director, Press Office
  Asunción Piñán, Head of area quality management, Quality & good practices
  Ana-Carmen Saura, Deputy Director, Office of the President
  María Velasco, Head of area, Subdirectorate General for Tourism, Science and Technology Statistics

Subdirectorate General for Analysis, Coordination and Statistics (Under-Secretariat for Agriculture, Fisheries and Food; Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food.)

Andrés Escudero, Deputy Director General
Miguel-Angel Álvarez, Coordinator of the Statistics Area
Olivia Merino, Head of the area, Technical Adviser

Subdirectorate General for Foresight, Strategy and Energy Regulations (Ministry for the Ecological Transition and the Demographic Challenge

Miriam Bueno, Deputy Director General**,** Subdirectorate General for Foresight, Strategy and Energy Regulations
María José Postigo, Head of Planning and Statistical Methodology Area, Statistical Working Group (GTE)
Miguel Santos, Head of Energy Statistics Area, Subdirectorate General for Foresight, Strategy and Energy Regulations

Subdirectorate General for Economic Studies and Statistics (Ministry of Transport, Mobility and Urban Agenda

Gerardo Gavilanes, Deputy Director General
Juan Manuel Ropero, Head of Area
Luis González, Head of Area

The High Council on Statistics and the Interterritorial Statistics Committee

Sabina Lobato, Director of Training, Employment, Projects and Agreements Foundation for Cooperation and the Social Inclusion of the Disabled (ONCE)
Ramiro Lomba, Director of the Asturian Society for Economic and Industrial Studies, Principality of Asturias.
Jesús López-Fidalgo, Spanish Society of Statistics and Operations Research, Institute of Data Science and Artificial Intelligence of the University of Navarre.
Ildefonso Villán, Head of Judicial Statistics, High Council of the Judiciary

The Interministerial Statistics Commission.

Juan Peñalosa, Director, Statistics department, Bank of Spain;
Javier Muñoz, Deputy Director General for Studies, Analyses and Action Plans, Ministry of Industry;
Jesús Ibáñez, Deputy Director General, Statistics and Studies Unit, Ministry of Education and Vocational Training

Business associations and federations and trade unions

Raúl Mínguez, Director of Research Department, Spanish Chamber of Commerce,
Carlos Martín, Director of the Research Department, "Labour Commissions" (CCOO) Trade Union
Olga Quirós, General Secretary, ASEDIE, Multisectorial Information Association.
Javier Pérez, Information Sources Commission´s President, ASEDIE

Data providers

Mª Luz Gómez, Deputy Director of Statistics, State Tax Administration Agency,
Julio-Marcos García, Deputy Director of Statistics, General Treasury of the Social Security, Ministry of Social Security
Nuria Varela, Deputy Assistant Director, Spanish Agricultural Guarantee Found (FEGA) – Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food
Edita Pereira, Director of the Research Service, Spanish Confederation of Employers Organizations (CEOE)
Paloma Blanco, Assistant Director of the Research Service, Spanish Confederation of Employers Organizations (CEOE)

Providers of new data sources

Mario Romero, Head of Business Development for Spain at LUCA: Data-Driven Decisions (Big Data B2B Telefónica)
Representative from CENTROS COMERCIALES CARREFOUR, S.A.

Media
Amalia Arauzo, Europa Press Agency
Rebeca Gimeno, Mediaset España (Tele 5 – NIUS)
Journalist, International News agency

Scientific community

Rosa Lillo, Full professor (Statistics and Operations Research) Head of IBIDat (uc3m -Santander Big Data Institute)
Javier Montero, Full professor of mathematics, Vice-Rector for Academic Organisation, Complutense University of Madrid
Felix Muñoz, Associate Professor, Department of Economic Analysis: Economic Theory and Economic History. Autonoma University of Madrid